

EXHIBIT 4

[ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served

Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@dechert.com>
To: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>
Cc: "McGinley, Michael" <Michael.McGinley@dechert.com>

Thu, Oct 31, 2024 at 4:31 PM

Tina:

Thanks for your patience while Fox sought to work out its position. Fox believes that the federal court does have jurisdiction over Mr. Biden's action, and we intend to file an amended Notice of Removal to address some of the issues that you and I have been discussing. We expect that we will file the amended notice tomorrow. Although I hope that our amended notice will persuade you that there is federal jurisdiction, we understand that Mr. Biden may still file a motion to remand. If you require more time to prepare such a draft motion (it's possible that the amended notice restarts the 30-day clock, but I have not researched that question), Fox will certainly be willing to work with you on a reasonable extension for your motion, given your courtesy on the front end.

Best,

Steve

Steven A. Engel
Partner

Dechert LLP
+1 202 261 3369 Direct
+1 212 698 3512 Direct
+1 917 335 3806 Mobile
steven.engel@dechert.com
dechert.com

From: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>
Sent: Thursday, October 31, 2024 4:00 PM
To: Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@Dechert.com>
Cc: McGinley, Michael <Michael.McGinley@dechert.com>
Subject: Re: [ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served

Steven, circling back on this.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thanks,

Tina

TINA GLANDIAN

ATTORNEY AT LAW

*ADMITTED IN NY, CA, NV & FL



GERAGOS & GERAGOS
A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

256 5th Avenue
New York, New York 10001

TELEPHONE (213) 625-3900
FACSIMILE (213) 232-3255

WWW.GERAGOS.COM

This e-mail, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client and other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this e-mail, including any attachments, and notify me by return mail or e-mail.

On Tue, Oct 29, 2024 at 2:27 PM Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com> wrote:

Sounds good. Thanks Steven.

TINA GLANDIAN

ATTORNEY AT LAW

*ADMITTED IN NY, CA, NV & FL



GERAGOS & GERAGOS
A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

256 5th Avenue
New York, New York 10001

TELEPHONE (213) 625-3900
FACSIMILE (213) 232-3255

WWW.GERAGOS.COM

This e-mail, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client and other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this e-mail, including any attachments, and notify me by return mail or e-mail.

On Tue, Oct 29, 2024 at 2:22 PM Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@dechert.com> wrote:

Thanks, Tina. I appreciate the courtesy of the heads up. As of yesterday, we still have not received the actual service from the Secretary of State, but I understand that at a certain point, there may be a deadline. I will check back in with our clients and circle back by tomorrow.

From: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 29, 2024 2:18 PM
To: Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@Dechert.com>
Cc: McGinley, Michael <Michael.McGinley@dechert.com>
Subject: Re: [ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Steven,

I wanted to check back in. Our motion for remand is due in two weeks so we can't hold off any longer on getting started. Since we intend to ask for our fees and costs related to the motion (and to avoid unnecessary work for both sides as well as the Court), I wanted to give you the opportunity to withdraw the notice of removal again based on the affidavit of service showing that Fox News Network, LLC was served via the Secretary of State on October 15 at 9:56 a.m. (which I provided to you on October 17), the email I received on October 15 at 10:49 a.m. confirming service on the Secretary of State (which I provided to you on October 21), as well as the lack of complete diversity and the lack of any fraudulent joinder (as explained to you in my October 21 email). Please let me know your position so we can proceed accordingly on our end.

Thanks,

Tina

TINA GLANDIAN

ATTORNEY AT LAW

*ADMITTED IN NY, CA, NV & FL



256 5th Avenue
New York, New York 10001

TELEPHONE (213) 625-3900
FACSIMILE (213) 232-3255

WWW.GERAGOS.COM

This e-mail, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client and other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this e-mail, including any attachments, and notify me by return mail or e-mail.

On Fri, Oct 25, 2024 at 4:02 PM Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@dechert.com> wrote:

Looks our emails just crossed.

From: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>
Sent: Friday, October 25, 2024 4:01 PM
To: Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@Dechert.com>
Cc: McGinley, Michael <Michael.McGinley@dechert.com>
Subject: Re: [ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Steven, can I get the signed affirmations please?

TINA GLANDIAN

ATTORNEY AT LAW
*ADMITTED IN NY, CA, NV & FL

256 5th Avenue
New York, New York 10001

Telephone (213) 625-3900
Facsimile (213) 232-3255

WWW.GERAGOS.COM

This e-mail, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client and other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this e-mail, including any attachments, and notify me by return mail or e-mail.

On Thu, Oct 24, 2024 at 3:08 PM Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@dechert.com> wrote:

Thanks, Tina. Yes, Fox has been checking with CT Corp on the notification.

From: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>
Sent: Thursday, October 24, 2024 3:03 PM
To: Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@Dechert.com>
Cc: McGinley, Michael <Michael.McGinley@dechert.com>
Subject: Re: [ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Steven,

I believe there is a backlog and it can take several weeks to receive notice of the process personally served on the Secretary of State. Have you checked with CT Corp. at 28 Liberty St., since that is who the Secretary of State would presumably notify?

In the interim, I have attached two affirmations of acceptance of service for you to sign (on behalf of Viet Dinh and Jason Klarman). Please return the signed copies to me at your earliest convenience.

Thank you,

Tina Glandian

Attorney at Law

*admitted in NY, CA, NV & FL



GERAGOS & GERAGOS
A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

256 5th Avenue
New York, New York 10001

Telephone (213) 625-3900
Facsimile (213) 232-3255

WWW.GERAGOS.COM

This e-mail, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client and other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this e-mail, including any attachments, and notify me by return mail or e-mail.

On Wed, Oct 23, 2024 at 6:38 PM Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@dechert.com> wrote:

Tina:

Thank you passing along the email below. Fox has not yet received any service from the Secretary of State. Can we let you know Fox's position in a few days, by which time hopefully, we will have received the notice? I can't promise that we will reach agreement, but Fox is interested in avoiding unnecessary litigation, and you do have 30 days to file the motion to remand. So it does not appear that you need to rush to prepare the motion.

Steve

Steven A. Engel
Partner

Dechert LLP
+1 202 261 3369 Direct

+1 212 698 3512 Direct

+1 917 335 3806 Mobile
steven.engel@dechert.com
dechert.com

From: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>
Sent: Monday, October 21, 2024 2:34 PM
To: Engel, Steven A. <Steven.Engel@Dechert.com>
Cc: McGinley, Michael <Michael.McGinley@dechert.com>
Subject: Fwd: [ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Steven,

Per your request, I am forwarding you the email I received on October 15 at 10:49 a.m. wherein Robert Lawson shared a service notification with me, advising me that Andrew Cervelli had completed service on Fox News Network, LLC via the Secretary of State at 9:56 a.m. To be clear, this is a different process server than the one who served Mr. Klarman.

I don't intend to waste a lot of additional time on this issue. As previously noted, your representation to the Court that the Notice of Removal was filed before any parties were served is false based on the earlier service on Fox News Network, LLC. Additionally, there is no fraudulent joinder here. As you know, Mr. Dinh was identified and discussed in the original complaint. The reason he was not named as a defendant

at that time was because we believed, based on Fox's prompt removal of the offensive content, that Fox would do the right thing and settle (or at least attempt to settle) the case once it was filed. For that reason, we did not originally name any individual defendants including Mr. Dinh. However, when it became evident that Fox intended to litigate this matter (and when it removed the case to federal court where we knew the case does not belong), we dismissed the original action and later re-filed the case adding the two individual defendants we were able to identify as responsible parties in the absence of discovery. Aside from Mr. Dinh, we have a good faith basis to believe that discovery may reveal other individual defendants who are also CA residents. Based on both our earlier service on Fox News Network, LLC as well as the lack of fraudulent joinder, your Notice of Removal is deficient and improper. If we do not hear that you intend to withdraw it by close of business on Wednesday, we will begin preparing our Objections and Motion for Remand.

Thank you,

Tina

Tina Glandian

Attorney at Law

*admitted in NY, CA, NV & FL



256 5th Avenue
New York, New York 10001

Telephone (213) 625-3900
Facsimile (213) 232-3255

WWW.GERAGOS.COM

This e-mail, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client and other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this e-mail, including any attachments, and notify me by return mail or e-mail.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Robert Lawson** <notifications@mail.servemanager.com>
Date: Tue, Oct 15, 2024 at 10:49 AM
Subject: [ServeManager] Job #11989121 Served
To: Tina Glandian <tina@geragos.com>

Served

Robert Lawson shared a service notification with you:

Details

Process Server: ANDREW CERVELLI

Date & Time: Oct 15, 2024, 9:56 am EDT

Service Type: Secretary of State

Description of Service:

Recipient

Recipient: SOUE ZOUKY as New York Secretary of State Intake Agent

Age: 60s

Ethnicity: Caucasian

Gender: Female

Weight: 130s

Height: 5'3"

Hair: Brown

Eyes: Brown

Description of Recipient:

Service Address

99 WASHINGTON AVENUE, ALBANY , NEW YORK 12210

Job & Case

Job: 11989121

Priority: Routine

Job Type: Standard

Recipient: SOUE ZOUKY as NYDOS Intake Agent

Case: 159463/2024

Plaintiff: ROBERT HUNTER BIDEN

Defendant: FOX NEWS NETWORK, LLC, FOX CORPORATION, VIET D. DIHH, JASON KLARMAN and "JOHN and JANE DOES" 1-100

Court: SUPREME

County: NEW YORK

Documents: NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING, SUMMONS and VERIFIED COMPLAINT - Jury Trial Demanded

Shared with you by:

Robert Lawson
Lawson Legal Services / New York Process Servers
lawsonlegal@hotmail.com
800 695-7480

This e-mail is from Dechert LLP, a law firm, and may contain information that is confidential or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy or distribute the e-mail or any attachments. Instead, please notify the sender and delete the e-mail and any attachments. Thank you.

This e-mail is from Dechert LLP, a law firm, and may contain information that is confidential or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy or distribute the e-mail or any attachments. Instead, please notify the sender and delete the e-mail and any attachments. Thank you.

This e-mail is from Dechert LLP, a law firm, and may contain information that is confidential or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy or distribute the e-mail or any attachments. Instead, please notify the sender and delete the e-mail and any attachments. Thank you.

This e-mail is from Dechert LLP, a law firm, and may contain information that is confidential or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy or distribute the e-mail or any attachments. Instead, please notify the sender and delete the e-mail and any attachments. Thank you.

This e-mail is from Dechert LLP, a law firm, and may contain information that is confidential or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy or distribute the e-mail or any attachments. Instead, please notify the sender and delete the e-mail and any attachments. Thank you.

image002.jpg
1K [View Download](#)